Working Group Paper #3, Appendix A

Expanding Sanctions on Putin's Propogandists

The International Working Group on Russian Sanctions

October 20, 2022

https://fsi.stanford.edu/working-group-sanctions

The International Working Group on Russian Sanctions aims to provide expertise and experience to governments and companies around the world by assisting with the formulation of sanctions proposals that will increase the cost to Russia of invading Ukraine and that will support democratic Ukraine in the defense of its territorial integrity and national sovereignty. Our working group is comprised of independent experts from many countries, but coordinates and consults with the Government of Ukraine and those governments imposing sanctions. This consultation process helps to inform our views, but our members express independently held opinions and do not take direction from or act at the behest of the government of Ukraine or any other person or entity. This publication is an appendix to Working Paper #3 on individual sanctions. This appendix was released by the coordinator of the Working Group, in close consultation with expert members of the our working group on individuals sanctions, but does not necessarily reflect the views of all members. All of our papers, as well as additional memos and publications from our working group members can be found at on our website: https://fsi.stanford.edu/working-group-sanctions.

In our Working Group Paper #3 called <u>Individual Sanctions Roadmap</u>, we singed out propagandists as one of the ten categories of individuals to be sanctioned for "*hav*[ing] *consistently reproduced false narratives in line with the Kremlin's policies, laying the ideological foundation for Russia's war and concealing ongoing crimes.*" Although Working Group Paper #3 lists a dozen of subcategories (journalists, celebrities, members of academia, clergy, etc.), they can be divided into two broad groups: those who generate ideas for propaganda (ideologists) and those who transmit and propagate these ideas (mouthpieces). The division line is not always clear. In practical terms, identifying those in the first group is much more difficult than those in the second. The representatives of the second group (journalists, celebrities, clergy, etc.), whose activity is aimed at garnering larger audiences, are easily traceable whereas the representatives of the first one (members of academia, think-tanks, etc.) are likely to be out of the spotlight. Still, it is these persons who lay theoretical foundation for the Russian propaganda by manipulating or distorting historical facts, scientific research, and so on. As a consequence, to date most of the ideologists have managed to escape sanctions altogether, except for the most notorious of them, such as Alexander Dugin. Devoting more attention to sanctioning ideologists, therefore, must a key component of straightening sanctions on Russians as a means to hasten the end of Putin's invasion of Ukraine.

In this context it is worth mentioning that academic or expert affiliation of ideologists should not, however, be taken lightly as implying academic freedom and independence. Notorious think-tanks (like Valdai Discussion Club, Izborsk Club, Foreign and Defense Policy Council, Russian International Affairs Council (RIAC), and Russian Institute for Strategic Studies (RISS)) typically have close ties with high ranking officials (annual meeting with Putin at Valdai Discussion Club are self-explanatory. RIAC and RISS are chaired by the former Minister of Foreign Affairs and Prime Minister respectively. The state or entities close to the states sponsor many of these organizations and individuals. Members of such think-tanks often act as advisors to various Russian government organizations. While formally keeping distance from Kremlin, many (not all) Russian think tanks are nurturing and supporting ideas that support Putin's war. Their role in supporting Putin's barbaric invasion of Ukraine must be given greater scrutiny.

Propogandists or transmitters of information that supports Russia's invasion of Ukraine constitute the lion's share of this category of Russian individuals who should be sanctioned. As Peter Pomerantsev has written, "Russian military theory sees information operations as integral to military operations to an unprecedented extent – Russian state media managers even received military medals for their role during the annexation of Crimea in 2014. And rather than just nasty words broadcast on radio or TV, information operations are now continued in tightly controlled digital campaigns with everything from online "troll farms" through to search engine optimisation, which rise and crest in tandem with military operations."¹ Those in the business of propagating information to support Putin's invasion are not journalists or pundits, but soldiers in this war.

So too are those peddling Russian soft power indirectly in support of Russia's war. These artists are oftentimes as dangerous as corporate propaganda outlets on television, radio channels, and newspapers, due to their ability to spread propaganda swiftly and effectively through a large target audience. Most of them are also masters of hypocrisy. Despite having an instrumental role in spreading pro-war propaganda, inciting hatred, and badmouthing the West, they vacation abroad and enjoying lavish lifestyles anchored in part in the West. Many

¹ https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2022/oct/16/propaganda-russia-ukraine-war-crimes-accountability

of them own luxurious properties in Europe and United States. These individuals act openly either through their social media or by performing during the propaganda rallies in support of the illegal annexation of Crimea and the invasion of Ukraine. They perform at concerts, plays and festivals in support of Putin. Some even have visited the occupied territories of Ukraine, thereby directly undermining Ukraine's territorial integrity. Some individuals claim to have visited Mariupol Drama Theater² and afterwards supported the Kremlin's narrative that shifts responsibility for Russia's crimes instead onto Ukrainian populations. These people must be sanctioned too.

Below is a partial list of Russian opinion leaders, artists, and so-called intellectuals who openly or indirectly produce narratives in line with the Kremlin's propaganda, spread misinformation about Russia's war against Ukraine, and therefore support policies that undermine Ukraine's territorial integrity, sovereignty, independence, and security. Since 2014, many of them have visited the temporarily occupied territories of Ukraine. Their activities are unrelated to journalism, freedom of expression, or scholarship, but fall squarely into activities that purposely help Putin's war effort in Ukraine. Democracies around the world should add them to their sanctions list.

In expanding sanctions to this category of Russians, we also ask individual countries and the European Union to better coordinate their activities. Whereas more than 100 individuals, falling under the 'propaganda' criteria, have been sanctioned in at least one G7 jurisdiction, only a few of these individuals have been sanctioned by all G7 States.

Finally, our recommendations of Russian propagandists to be sanctioned is only partial. We encourage other independent expert groups and non-governmental organizations to make their own suggestions as to others who should be added to this list.

- 1. ALLEGROVA Irina Aleksandrovna
- 2. ANDREASIAN Sarik Garnikovich
- 3. ANDREEVA Ekaterina Sergeevna³
- 4. ARKHIPOV Roman Igorevich
- 5. AVERIN Maksim Viktorovich
- 6. AVERRYANOV Vitaliy Vladimirovich (Izborsk Club)
- 7. ASKER-ZADE Nailya Vagif kyzy⁴
- 8. BABKINA Nadezhda Georgievna⁵
- 9. BADOEVA Zhanna Iosifovna
- 10. BASHAROV Marat Alimzhanovich⁶

⁵ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

² <u>https://dailymoscow.ru/author/kristina-potupchik-ya-sama-ezdila-v-mariupol-i-byla-v-dramteatre-zrelishche-konechno-zhutkoe</u>

³ Sanctioned by US and Ukraine.

⁴ Sanctioned in UK, Canada and Ukraine.

- 11. BASKOV Nikolai Viktorovich⁷
- 12. BELAN Viktor Nikolaevich / Dima BILAN
- 13. BEZRUKOV Sergei Vitalevich⁸
- 14. BOBUNETS Sergey Stanislavovich
- 15. BOIARSKII Mikhail Sergeevich⁹
- 16. BORISOVA Dana Alexandrovna
- 17. BORDACHEV Timofei Viacheslavovich (Valdai Club)
- 18. BURNYSHEV Igor Yurievich
- 19. BUTMAN Igor Mikhailovich
- 20. BUYNOV Alexander Nikolaevich
- 21. BUZOVA / TARASOVA Olga Igorevna
- 22. BYSTRITSKY Andrey Georgievich (Valdai Club)
- 23. CHICHERINA Yuliia Dmitrievna
- 24. DAINEKO Victoria Petrovna
- 25. DIDULA Valery Mikhailovich
- 26. DOBRONRAVOV Viktor Fyodorovich
- 27. DOBRONRAVOV Aleksandr Andreevich
- 28. DOLINA/KUDELMAN/MIONCHINSKAYA Larisa Aleksandrovna
- 29. DOVLATOVA Alla Aleksandrovna / EVSTRAKHINA Marina Aleksandrovna
- 30. DUBTSOVA Irina Viktorovna
- 31. DUGIN Alexander Gelyevich¹⁰ (Eurasian Youth Union)
- 32. DUHOVA Alla Vladimirovna
- 33. DYUZHEV Dmitriy Petrovich
- EGORCHENKOV Dmitry Alexandrovich (Member of the expert council of RUDN University "RUSSIAN UNIVERSITY OF FRIENDSHIP OF PEOPLE", Valdai Club)
- 35. EGOROVA Snezhana Aleksandrovna¹¹
- 36. FOMIN Dmitriy Anatolyevich
- 37. GAGARINA Polina Sergeevna
- 38. GALUSTYAN Mikhail Sergeevich
- 39. GAZMANOV Oleg Mikhaylovich¹²
- 40. GAZMANOV Rodion Olegovich
- 41. GLUSHKO Sergey Vitalievich

⁶ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

¹² Sanctioned by EU, Switzerland and Ukraine.

⁷ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

⁸ Sanctioned by EU, Switzerland, Canada and Ukraine.

⁹ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

¹⁰ Sanctioned by EU, US, Switzerland, Canada and Ukraine.

¹¹ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

- 42. ILNITSKY Andrei Mikhailovich (Advisor to the Minister of Defense of the Russian Federation, Valdai Club)
- 43. IVANOV Alexander Viktorovich (IVAN)
- 44. IVANOV Alexandr Yulievych
- 45. KANDELAKI Tinatin Givievna¹³
- 46. KARAGANOV Sergei Alexandrovich (Valdai Club)
- 47. KEOSAYAN Tigran Edmondovich¹⁴
- 48. KOSTIUSHKIN Stanislav Mikhailovich¹⁵
- 49. KHARATYAN Dmitrii Vadimovich¹⁶
- 50. KHRAMOV Andrey Vladimirovich
- 51. KHARLAMOV Igor Yurievich¹⁷
- 52. KHRULEVA Elena Vladimirovna (Vaenga)
- 53. KIPELOV Valery Aleksandrovich
- 54. KIRKOROV Philip Bedrosovich
- 55. KISELEV / KISELYOV Dmitrii Konstantinovich¹⁸
- 56. KISELEV Yuri Vladimirovich (YurKiss)
- 57. KISELYOVA Elena Yurievna (Elena Sever)
- 58. KITAYEVA Maria Vladimirovna¹⁹
- 59. KORMUKHINA Olga Borisovna
- 60. KOROVIN Valeriy Mikhailovich (Izborsk Club, Public Chamber of the Russian Federation)
- 61. KOZACHENKO Vadim Gennadievich
- 62. KRASOVSKY / KUZNETSOV-KRASOVSKY Anton Vyacheslavovich²⁰
- 63. KRAVCHENKO Maria Olegovna
- 64. KRISTOVSKIY Sergei Evgenievich
- 65. KRISTOVSKY Vladimir Evgenievich
- 66. KRYSANOVA Ekaterina Valerievna
- 67. KUIEK Karolina Myroslavivna²¹
- 68. KUPRYK Sergey Vasilyevich
- 69. LANTRATOV Vladyslav Valerievich
- 70. LAZAREV Sergey Vyacheslavovich

- ¹⁶ Sanctioned by Ukraine.
- ¹⁷ Sanctioned by Ukraine.
- ¹⁸ Sanctioned in five G7 jurisdictions and Ukraine.
- ¹⁹ Sanctioned by US and Ukraine.
- ²⁰ Sanctioned in five G7 jurisdictions and Ukraine.
- ²¹ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

¹³ Sanctioned by US, Canada and Ukraine.

¹⁴ Sanctioned by EU, UK, Canada, Switzerland, Australia and Ukraine.

¹⁵ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

71. LEBEDEV Artemy Andreyevich²²

72. LEPSVERIDZE Grigory Viktorovich²³

73. LESHCHENKO Lev Valerianovich²⁴

74. LUKYANOV Fedor Alexandrovich

75. MAIDANOV Denys Vasilyevich

76. MAKEEVA Anastasia Vasilievna

77. MAMENKO Igor Vladimirovych

78. MANUCHAROV Vyacheslav Rafaelevich

79. MARSHAL (MINKOV) Alexander Vitalievich

80. MASHKOV Vladimir Lvovich²⁵

81. MATVEICHUK Gleb Alymovych

82. MELNYKOV Matvey Alexandrovych (MOT)

83. MGOYAN Zarifa Poshaevna

84. MIKHAILOV Alexander Yakovlevich

85. MIKHAILOV Sergei Vladimirovich (TASS News Agency)²⁶

86. MIKHAILOV Stanislav Vladimirovich

87. MIKHALKOV Nikita Sergeevich

88. MILYAVSKAYA Lolita Markovna

89. MUZA Dmitry Evgenievich (Izborsk Club)

90. MYKHALKOVA Yulia Evgenievna

91. NETREBKO Anna Yurievna

92. NAROCHITSKAIA Nataliia Alekseevna (Izborsk Club)

93. NIKULIN Maksym Yuryevich

94. OBRAZTSOVA Elena Vasiliyevna

95. OKHLOBYSTIN Ivan Ivanovich²⁷

96. OMAROV Kurban Omarovych

97. PANAYOTOV Aleksandr Sergeyevich

98. PERMYAKOVA Aleksandra Andreevna

99. PERFILOVA Alla Yurievna (Valeria)

100. PETROSYAN Evgeniy Vaganovich

101. PLATONOV Oleg Anatolyevich (Institute of Russian Civilization)

102. PODDUBNYY Alexey Viktorovych

103. POPLAVSKAYA Yana Evgenievna

104. PORECHENKOV Mikhail Evgenievich²⁸

²² Sanctioned by Ukraine.

²³ Sanctioned by US.

²⁴ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

²⁵ Sanctioned by EU, Switzerland, Canada and Ukraine.

²⁶ Sanctioned by EU, UK, Canada, Switzerland and Ukraine.

²⁷ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

²⁸ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

- 105. POTUPCHYK Krystyna Andreevna
- 106. POVALIY Taisiia Mykolaivna²⁹
- 107. PRESNYAKOV Vladimir Vladimirovich
- 108. PRIGOZHIN Iosif Igorevich
- 109. PRILEPIN Yevgeniy Nikolaevich
- 110. PROKHANOV Alexander Andreevich (Izborsk Club, Deputy Chairman of the Public Council under the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation)
- 111. PROKLOVA Elena Igorevna
- 112. PYEHA Stanislav Pyatrasovych
- 113. RASTORGUEV Nikolay Vyacheslavovich
- 114. RAZBEGAEV Vyacheslav Vyacheslavovich
- 115. REKSHAN Vladimir Olgerdovich
- 116. ROMANOV Alexey Dmitrievich
- 117. ROMANOV Igor Evgenievich
- 118. ROZANOV Oleg Vasilievich (Izborsk Club)
- 119. RYBIN Viktor Viktorovich
- 120. SADKOVA (MALINOVSKAYA) Marina Nikolaevna
- 121. SAGAL Dimitrii Alekseevich (Izborsk Club)
- 122. SARDAROV Amiran Shirinovich
- 123. SATANOVSKY EVGENY YANOVICH (president of the Institute of the Middle East, expert council of the State Duma Committee on the development of civil society)
- 124. SAVICHEVA Julia Stanislavovna
- 125. SEDOKOVA Anna Vladimirovna
- 126. SEMENOVICH Anna Grigoryevna
- 127. SENCHUKOVA Natalya Valentinovna
- 128. SEROV (SYAROV) Alexander Nikolaevich³⁰
- 129. SHCHEDROVITSKY Pyotr Georgievich (Center for Strategic Research "North-West")
- 130. SHEYNIN Artem Grigoryevich³¹
- 131. SHUFUTINSKY Mikhail Zakharovich
- 132. SHUKSHINA Maria Vasilievna
- 133. SHUROCHKINA Anna Vladimirovna (Nyusha)
- 134. SIMONYAN Margarita Simonovna³²
- 135. SKABEYEVA Olga Vladimirovna³³
- 136. SKLYAR Alexander Feliksovich
- 137. SLANEVSKAYA Anastasia Vladimirovna (SLAVA)

³⁰ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

³¹ Sanctioned by EU, UK, Canada, Switzerland and Ukraine.

³³ Sanctioned in five G7 jurisdictions and Ukraine.

²⁹ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

³² Sanctioned in six G7 jurisdictions and Ukraine.

- 138. SMIRNOVA Polina Sergeevna
- 139. STAROVOITOV Stas
- 140. STEKLOV Vladimir Alexandrovich
- 141. SUKHORUKOV Viktor Ivanovich
- 142. SUSHENTSOV Andrey Andreevich (Valdai Club)
- 143. SUSLOV Dmitry Vyacheslavovich (Center for Comprehensive European and International Studies, Russian International Affairs Council, Valdai Club)
- 144. TELEGINA Pelageya Sergeevna
- 145. TODORENKO Regina Petrovna³⁴
- 146. TOPALOV Vladislav Mikhailovich
- 147. TORKUNOV Anatoly Vasilievich (Valdai Club)
- 148. TRENIN Dmitry Vitalievich (former director of the Moscow Carnegie Center)
- 149. TSOY Anita Sergeevna
- 150. TSYGANOVA / ZHUKOVA Victoria Yuryevna
- 151. TURETSKY Mikhail Borisovich
- 152. TYMOSHCHUK Anatoliy Oleksandrovych
- 153. USPENSKAYA Lyubov Zalmanovna
- 154. USTIMENKO-VEINSTEIN Denis Aleksandrovich (DZHIGAN)
- 155. VAKULENKO Vasyl Mykhailovych
- 156. VINOKUR Vladimir Natanovich
- 157. VOITENKO Sergei Ivanovich
- 158. VYSOKOVA Klavdiya Vadimovna (Klava Koka)
- 159. WEBER Maria Yurievna
- 160. YAKOVLEVA Elena Alekseevna
- 161. YAKUBOVYCH Leonid Arkadevich
- 162. YUNUSOV Timur Ildarovich / TIMATI
- 163. ZAKHAROVA Svetlana Yurevna
- 164. ZAPASHNY Edgard Valterovich³⁵
- 165. ZHIGUNOV Sergey Victorovich
- 166. ZHUKOV Sergey Yevgenevich

³⁴ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

³⁵ Sanctioned by Ukraine.